WHAT'S NEW IN EMPLOYEE BENEFITS

A Summary of Current Case and Other Developments

By

Roger C. Siske
Michael R. Maryn
Barbara L. Smith
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP

ALI-ABA
PENSION, PROFIT-SHARING, WELFARE,
AND OTHER COMPENSATION PLANS
Washington, D.C.
October 7-9, 2004

The assistance of Mina Amir-Mokri, Shannon Skinner Anglin, Katharina E. Babich, Shelli Calland, Juanita Crookham, Dominic J. DeMatties, Arlene G. Dubin, Dana B. Gruen, H. Lauren Kim, Timothy M. Mlsna, Frank VanderPloeg, Lori Anne Ward and Stacy E. Wilhite in the preparation of this outline is gratefully acknowledged.

Copyright 2004
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP
All rights reserved
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................................. 1

II. SUPREME COURT CASES ................................................................................................................... 2
   A. Complete Preemption of HMO Benefit Determinations ................................................................. 2
   B. Suspension of Benefits and ERISA Section 204(g) ....................................................................... 11
   C. Status of Working Owners as Plan Participants ........................................................................... 18
   D. Reverse Age Discrimination ........................................................................................................... 25
   E. The Treating Physician Rule .......................................................................................................... 27
   F. Any Willing Provider Statutes and the Savings Clause ................................................................. 32
   G. State External Review Requirements for HMOs Not Subject to ERISA Preemption ................. 37
   H. Exclusion of IRAs from Bankruptcy Estate .................................................................................... 47

III. FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITY ......................................................................................................... 49
   A. Stock Drop Cases ............................................................................................................................ 50
      1. Enron ........................................................................................................................................... 50
      2. Decisions Pre-Dating the Enron Decision ....................................................................................... 63
      3. Decisions Post-Dating the Enron Decision ...................................................................................... 72
   B. Fiduciary Status .............................................................................................................................. 95
      1. Employer Settlor/Fiduciary Distinction ......................................................................................... 96
      2. Individual Employees or Officers ................................................................................................. 98
      3. Human Resources Personnel ..................................................................................................... 102
4. Third Party Service Providers ........................................................................................................... 103
5. Insurers ........................................................................................................................................ 106
6. Trustees .......................................................................................................................................... 107
7. PBGC .............................................................................................................................................. 113

C. Duty of Disclosure and Related Claims .......................................................................................... 114
   1. Potential Benefit Enhancements .................................................................................................. 114
   2. Facts Affecting Entitlement to Existing Benefits .......................................................................... 125

D. Exclusive Benefit and Prudent Person Standards .......................................................................... 134

E. Prohibited Transactions .................................................................................................................... 139

F. Knowing Participation in a Breach of Fiduciary Duty ...................................................................... 142

G. Contribution Among Fiduciaries ...................................................................................................... 143

IV. ERISA LITIGATION .......................................................................................................................... 145

A. Limitation of Actions ........................................................................................................................ 145
   1. Claims for Breach of Fiduciary Duty ......................................................................................... 145
   2. Claims Other Than for Breach of Fiduciary Duty ...................................................................... 151
   3. Civil Forfeiture Actions Against Pension Funds ......................................................................... 162

B. Standing .......................................................................................................................................... 163
   1. Participant or Beneficiary Standing ............................................................................................. 163
   2. Derivative and Representational Standing .................................................................................. 165
   3. Standing under Plan Termination Process .................................................................................. 169

C. Standard of Review ........................................................................................................................ 169
   1. Plan Language .............................................................................................................................. 170
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Application of Abuse of Discretion Standard of Review</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Conflicts of Interest</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Documents Considered in Determining Standard of Review</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Standard of Review When Claim Deemed Denied</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comply with ERISA's Notice Requirements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Standard of Review Applicable to Decisions Made under Top Hat Plans</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Effect of Standard of Review on Evidence Considered by Court</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. What Constitutes the Administrative Record</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Discovery Permitted When Review Is for Abuse of Discretion</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Need for Remand upon a Finding of an Abuse of Discretion</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Jurisdiction and Venue</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Personal Jurisdiction</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Removal</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Appellate Jurisdiction Over Remand to Plan Administrator</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Subject Matter Jurisdiction under the Declaratory Judgment Act</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Subject Matter Jurisdiction Over Claim Brought Pursuant to Terminated</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Claims to Which the Exhaustion Requirement Applies</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Exceptions to Exhaustion Requirement</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Awards of Attorney Fees and Costs</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Under ERISA Section 502(g)(1)</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Under ERISA Section 502(g)(2) ................................................................. 244
3. When Case Improperly Removed to Federal Court ........................................ 246

G. Proper Defendants ......................................................................................... 247
   1. Actions under ERISA Section 502(a)(1)(B) ................................................. 247
   2. Actions under ERISA Section 502(a)(3) ..................................................... 249

H. Remedies ........................................................................................................ 250
   1. Effect of Availability of Another Remedy on Relief Under ERISA Section 502(a)(3) ................................................................. 251
   2. What Constitutes Equitable Relief .............................................................. 258

I. Service of Process ............................................................................................ 258

J. Waiver and Releases ......................................................................................... 285

V. PREEMPTION .................................................................................................... 288
   A. Supreme Court Preemption Guidance ......................................................... 288
   B. Benefit Claims and Related Torts ................................................................. 291
      1. Medical Malpractice for Mixed Decisions of Treatment and Eligibility ................................................................. 291
      2. Contractual Benefit Claims and Related Torts ........................................... 294
      3. Misrepresentation, Fraud and Similar Claims ............................................ 299
      4. Actions By Non-Participants .................................................................... 304
   C. Employer, Plan and Third Party Claims ....................................................... 304
      1. Employer and Plan Claims Against Service Providers .............................. 304
      2. Medical Provider Claims Against Plans .................................................. 307
      3. Legal Malpractice .................................................................................... 308
   D. Insurance Regulation and the Savings Clause ............................................ 308

- 41 -
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Insurance and HMO Regulation</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. “Bad Faith Refusal to Pay” and Related Causes of Action</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Mandated Policy Terms</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Multiemployer Welfare Arrangements</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Health Industry Regulation</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Subrogation Claims and Defenses</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Subrogation Claims Based on State Law</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. State Restrictions and Defenses to Subrogation Claims</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Attorneys’ Fee Claims Against Subrogation Recoveries</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Domestic Partner Coverage Laws</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Enforcing Contributions to Multiemployer Plans</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Wage, Labor and Occupational Regulation</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Occupational Regulation</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Workplace Safety</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Employment Discrimination</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Workers’ Compensation</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. Preemption of Federal Law</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. Sovereign Immunity</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. Marriage and Beneficiaries</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Pre-ERISA Acts and Omissions</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. PLANS SUBJECT TO ERISA</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Group Insurance Plans Excluded from ERISA under Safe Harbor Provision</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Employee Benefit Plan Established or Maintained by an Employer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Ongoing Administrative Schemes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Dual Owner/Employee Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>Employee Pension Benefit Plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.</td>
<td>Top Hat Plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.</td>
<td>Church Plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H.</td>
<td>Profit Sharing Plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>Converted Policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J.</td>
<td>Payroll Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K.</td>
<td>Settlement Agreements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.</td>
<td>Tribal Plans</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**VII. REPORTING AND DISCLOSURE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Summary Plan Descriptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>What Constitutes a Summary Plan Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Publication of Summary Plan Descriptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Penalty under ERISA Section 502(c)(1)(B) for Failure to Provide Requested Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Necessity of a Request</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Who May Be Held Liable under ERISA Section 502(c)(1)(B)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Factors Affecting Decision to Award Penalty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Which Document Controls When the Terms of the Documents Conflict</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Notification of Denial of Benefits</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VIII. INTERFERENCE WITH RIGHTS (ERISA SECTION 510)

A. The Prima Facie Case

1. All Elements of Prima Facie Case Established

2. What Constitutes Evidence of Specific Intent

3. Evidence of Change in Employment Relationship

4. Evidence of Entitlement to Benefits

5. Participation in Internal Inquiry

6. Standard Applied in Retaliation Case

B. Determining if an Employer’s Explanation is a Pretext

IX. FEDERAL COMMON LAW OF ERISA

A. Estoppel

B. Equitable Restitution

C. Make Whole Doctrine

D. Common Fund Doctrine

E. Unjust Enrichment

F. Negligence

X. AMENDMENT OR TERMINATION OF WELFARE BENEFIT PLANTS

A. Right to Amend or Terminate in Collective Bargaining Agreement Context

B. Right to Amend or Terminate in Non-Collective Bargaining Agreement Context

XI. COBRA